FLORIDA COORDINATING COUNCIL ON MOSQUITO CONTROL

FLORIDA DEPARTMENT OF AGRICULTURE AND CONSUMER SERVICES

FACILITATOR’S SUMMARY REPORT OF THE APRIL 8, 2004 MEETING

Gainesville, Florida

Meeting Design & Facilitation By

Florida Conflict Resolution Consortium

Report By Jeff A. Blair

jblair@fsu.edu
http://consensus.fsu.edu
OVERVIEW OF COUNCIL’S KEY RECOMMENDATIONS

THURSDAY, APRIL 8, 2004

Opening and Meeting Attendance
After determining a quorum was present, Chair Tom Loyless opened the meeting at 10:07 AM. Listed below are the Council members who attended the meeting: Doug Carlson for John Beidler, Carina Blackmore, Alex Cordero, Randy Dominy (by phone), Edsel Fussell, Mark Glisson, Patricia Harden, Mark Latham, Tom Loyless, Lenore McCullagh, John Milio, John Smith, and Walter Tabachnick.

DACS Staff in Attendance
David Dame, Steve Dwinell, Mike Page, and Jennifer Simpson.

Facilitation
The meeting was facilitated by Jeff Blair.

Agenda Review and Approval
The Council voted unanimously, 13 - 0 in favor, to approve the agenda as amended including the following objectives.

♦ To Approve Regular Procedural Topics
♦ To Review and Approve Updated Workplan
♦ To Discuss Council Attendance and Representation
♦ To Hear a Report from the Subcommittee on Managed Marshes
♦ To Hear a Report from the Subcommittee on Aerial Spraying
♦ To Hear an Update on Malaria Control Efforts
♦ To Hear a Report and Discuss the Use of Permethrin for Aerial Application
♦ To Hear a Report on Proposed Reintroduction of the Miami Blue Butterfly into the Florida Keys
♦ To Discuss Mosquito Control Aspects of the Arborvirus Response Plan
♦ To Discuss Use of Agnique to Control Pupae on Environmentally Sensitive Lands
♦ To Consider Public Comment
♦ To Identify Needed Next Steps and Agenda Items For Next Meeting
Approval of January 15, 2004 Minutes
The Council voted unanimously, 13 - 0 in favor, to approve the January 15, 2004 minutes as presented.

Review and Approval of Council’s Updated Workplan
The Council was asked to review the updated workplan and propose modifications.

Council Action:
Motion—The Council voted unanimously, 13 - 0 in favor, to approve the updated Council's Workplan as amended.

Amendments
Following are the approved amendments to the plan:
The Council agreed to remove Task B-1—membership representation and attendance—since the task is now accomplished.
The Council agreed to remove Task B-2—Commissioner appointments—since the task is now accomplished.
The Council agreed that Task C-2—Malaria Control Report—has also been accomplished and should be removed from the workplan.

Council Member Attendance/Representation Discussion
Tom Loyless, Council Chair, reported that all Council positions are now filled.

Council Member Attendance Policy Proposal
Jeff Blair proposed that the Council review a proposal for FCCMC attendance.

Council Action:
Motion—The Council voted unanimously, 13 - 0 in favor, to approve the FCCMC attendance policy as presented.

Following is the Adopted FCCMC Attendance Policy:
Any members of the Florida Coordinating Council on Mosquito Control who fails to attend three consecutive meetings will be contacted by the Department to determine why the member was not able to attend and if the member still wishes to serve on the Council. If the member cannot demonstrate his or her absence was for good cause, which includes but is not limited to personal or family illness or military service, or no longer wishes to serve on the Council, the Department will request the member submit a written resignation from the Council to the Commissioner of Agriculture. If the member refuses to resign, the Council will recommend to the Commissioner of Agriculture the member’s appointment be terminated and a new member be appointed as a replacement.
Report from the Subcommittee on Managed Marshes
Doug Carlson reported that a meeting of the subcommittee is planned for this month in Martin County. Doug also reported that the upcoming 4-year research workshop is being planned. The workshop and conference will be held in mid-October in the Titusville area.

Council Action:
Motion—The Council voted unanimously, 13 - 0 in favor, to accept the report as presented.

Report from the Subcommittee on Aerial Spraying
Mark Latham reported that the subcommittee met on April 7, 2004.

Council Action:
Motion—The Council voted unanimously, 13 - 0 in favor, to accept the report as presented.

Highlights of the Subcommittee on Aerial Spraying Report:
Nozzle classification was discussed by the subcommittee:
- No existing classification for micron size nozzles
- Subcommittee will be making proposals for such classification in order to assist with the directions for use on labels.
- Lowest accepted (ASA) classification - "very fine" results in VMD of 81 microns
- Suggested classification of "aerosol" is needed.
- Would like to see three more classifications so that chemical labels can refer to nozzle classifications.

Recommendations for research:
- AgDisc spray drift model is being modified to make more applicable to mosquito control, field validation at operational droplet sizes is also needed.
- Improvement for sampling techniques for droplet spectrum is also needed.
- Support for research on characterization of nozzles in Lee County wind tunnel is needed.

The next subcommittee meeting is not yet scheduled.

Report/Update on Malaria Control Efforts
Carina Blackmore reported that the issue has been resolved and no report was needed.
PERMETHRIN ISSUE

Permethrin Aerial Application Use Presentation and Discussion Overview:
The Council is in the process of reviewing existing research and relevant data, with the goal of making a recommendation to DACS on whether Florida should allow the aerial application of Permethrin—other than the current provisions allowing for use in emergencies. The issue revolves around a Florida specific (State imposed) label limitation regarding aerial application—Permethrin is permitted for ground application in Florida—and whether there are non-targeted effects, greater than those of the other mosquito control insecticides currently allowed for aerial application, that are sufficient to warrant the continuation of the ban. Another issue is whether there is a need for additional mosquito insecticides, such as Permethrin, to avoid insect resistance to the mosquito control insecticides currently permitted for aerial application in Florida.

Presentation
Dr. Shea Tuberty, from Appalachian State University, made a presentation to the Council on the effects of mosquito control insecticides on non-target organisms. Copies are available for members by request to DACS.

Following the presentation and questions, Tom Loyless requested that Dave Malone, now with ADAPCO, formerly of Cayman Islands mosquito control, offer his insights on the aerial application of Permethrin. Dave reported that Cayman routinely uses Permethrin, and it has been their main adulticide for the past six years. He reported that he has no hard data, but anecdotally there have been no reports of non-target effects.

Continuation of Permethrin Aerial Application Discussion
Following are some Council Member comments:

- Tabachnick- willing to discuss lifting of the restriction.
- Latham – Proposes a case by case lifting of the restriction upon request to DACS. Concept is the criteria for use would be more discretionary than are currently allowed.
- Dwinell - still a label issue - most labels require use only in "emergencies".
- McCullogh - what were the original concerns.
- Gale - original concerns were related to the development of resistance to the use of Permethrin, however, PHEREC review of reports does not show development of resistance.
- Harden - concern is for toxicity to fish, could it be an endocrine disrupter, is there enough research, are there long term impacts we don't know about.
- Tabachnick- there are no indications of non-target sensitivity, such as through a sentinel species.
- Glisson - is Permethrin similar in toxicity to the other allowed insecticides
- Zhong - Permethrin has a short residue life – the concern is for acute toxicity and not bioaccumulation.
Dame - USEPA allows states to be more restrictive.

**Process suggestion—non-binding straw poll**
The facilitator asked members to consider whether in concept, they are supportive of developing an affirmative recommendation to DACS regarding expanding the use of Permethrin for aerial application. In addition, the opposite question was asked, that is, if they are not supportive of the statement.

**Support aerial application in concept—9 voted yes.**
**Don’t support aerial application in concept—4 voted no.**

The facilitator asked member’s voting no, what their concerns are and whether any additional information is needed to assist them in evaluating the issue.

Members considerations:
- Would like to know the impacts on crab populations.
- Need information from other states on non-target impacts, especially bees, and concern about the environmental impacts statements on the label.
- Concern about toxicity to fish on state lands.
- Concern about effects on snails (some are listed), this could impact the Everglades Kite.

Tom Loyless commented that the aerial use of Permethrin in other states is limited, and to his knowledge only Delaware and some Midwest states are using the product aerially.

Mark Latham stated that the rotation of products using Permethrin is better for preventing the development of resistance by the insects.

Steve Dwinell suggested that the Council consider a limited application of aerial use, controlled by DACS and designed as a control study to collect data.

**Process suggestion—non-binding straw poll**
The facilitator asked members to consider whether in concept, they are supportive of developing a proposal recommending that DACS design a limited application control study of the aerial application of Permethrin.

**Support aerial application control study by DACS—13 voted yes, unanimous.**
**DACS agreed to develop a proposal and bring it for Council consideration at the next meeting.**
Report on Proposed Reintroduction of the Miami Blue Butterfly into the Florida Keys
Dr. Larry Hribar of the Florida Keys MCD made a presentation to the Council regarding the proposed project, which is currently being discussed by a work group convened to address the issue.

Following the report, members offered the following comments:

Mark Glisson noted that the FFWC is not doing this in a vacuum, and will work with MCD to avoid any conflicts.

John Milio stated that in regards to ESA population listings, they are limited to vertebrates, listings for a subspecies of invertebrates is hard to accomplish. The USFWS has been petitioned to list Miami Blue, but has not done so, perhaps because of the issue of genetic identity. He noted that other options exist besides listing as the butterfly as an endangered species.

Proposal
Members agreed to the following steps:
Request a FFWC representative to keep the council informed and invite the representative to report to the Council.

Tom Loyless will contact Brian Barnett and request an update on the status of the management plan and also request that he identify the appropriate method and entry point for Council input.

Mosquito Control Aspects of the Arbovirus Response Plan Report and Discussion

Carina Blackmore reported on the DOH plan and Tom Loyless reported on the DACS aspects of the plan.

Council member comments:

- Tabachnick- plan does not provide guidance to MCDs regarding their response. There are no trigger levels in the plan for MCD’s to use. How can DACS allocate resources to counties upon request?
- Blackmore - a set of best practices document would be useful to MCDs for their responses.
- Latham – it is hard to set triggers, what is the basis for any triggers - communication on case by case basis is the best approach at this point.
- Carlson – the tiered approach proposed is a step in the right direction.
Use of Agnique to Control Pupae on Environmentally Sensitive Lands

Alex Cordero notified the Council that DEP needs information on non-target effects prior to authorizing the use of Agnique to control pupae on environmentally sensitive public lands in the state. He stated that most of the data provided is based on Arosurf research, and DEP needs marine species information.

Alex further explained that the purpose for this discussion item is to solicit the Council’s support for identifying non-target species effects as a research priority.

Member Comments and Discussion:

- PHEREC proposal to conduct studies was not funded by DACS and is needed.
- Council is being asked to support acquisition of information. Allowing the use of pupacide on state lands would be beneficial to avoid adulticiding.
- Tom Loyless stated that members should review the article provided to the Council—“A review of monomolecular surface films as larvicides and pupicides of mosquitoes”—as it addresses many of the questions and concerns on this issue.
- Tabachnick—suggested the proposal seek alternative support from DEP, and approach concerned MCD’s and the manufacturers for support in getting this information.

Council Actions:

Tom Loyless proposed that the Council support a study on marine non-targets of Agnique by providing a letter of support for submittal to the Research Advisory Council.

Discussion on the motion:

Tabachnick- other research projects could also be supported in this way.

Harden - can research proposals be brought to council?

Tom Loyless a list of proposals will be brought to Council for review.

Walter Tabachnick proposed a friendly amendment: Council supports research on non-targets as a priority, but not provide a recommendation for a specific project.

The amendment was accepted as friendly and further discussion taken on the amended motion.

- Harden - need to set priorities for RFPs before RFPs go out.
- Blair - this is already on Council work plan and should be considered when setting the next meeting date in order to accomplish this task.

Motion—The Council voted, 12 – 1 in favor, to support research related to the effects of the application of mosquito control insecticides on non-target organisms as a recommended priority for the Research Advisory Committee.
Public Comment
Doug Carlson from the Indian River Mosquito Control District:
USFW has been developing a policy for Mosquito Control on public lands, a draft will be
available for comment and the Council should be aware of this.

Next Steps and Agenda Items for Next Meeting
- Permethrin - DACS proposal – Dwinell.
- Research Priorities for RFPs - Loyless.
- Report from researchers on data gaps - report from lab directors, USDA.
- Develop guidelines for submission of mosquitoes for virus isolation
  Subcommittee formed by Chairman Loyless and tasked with reporting
  recommendations to the Council at the next meeting
  Members: Carina Blackmore, chair, Tom Loyless, John Smith - Day, Burgess,
  Shroyer will be contacted for membership- Tom Loyless will convene Mosquito
  Submission Guidelines Subcommittee.
- Report on Mosquito Control funding at a state level - Dwinell
- Arbovirus Response Plan - MCD response - Tabachnick

Next Meeting Location and Date
July 22, 2004. Starting at 10:00 AM.
DACS, Division of Plant Industry’s Conference Room, 1911 SW 34th Street,
Gainesville, Florida 32614—Phone: 352-372-3505

Notes
- Communications to Council members should go through Jeff Blair.
- Send all reports and proposals to Jeff Blair prior to the meetings, for inclusion in
  reports and use with LCD projector display during meetings.
- Reports and agendas are available at http://consensus.fsu.edu

Adjourn
The Council voted unanimously, 13 – 0 in favor, to adjourn at 2:40 PM.
ATTACHMENT I

EVALUATION RESULTS

0 TO 10 RATING SCALE WHERE A 0 MEANS TOTALLY DISAGREE AND A 10 MEANS TOTALLY AGREE.

1. Please assess the overall meeting.
   8.6 The background information was very useful.
   8.6 The agenda packet was very useful.
   9.4 The objectives for the meeting were stated at the outset.
   8.9 Overall, the objectives of the meeting were fully achieved.
   8.5 Subcommittee on Managed Marshes report.
   8.0 Subcommittee on Aerial Spraying report.
   6.8 Update on malaria control efforts.
   8.2 Mosquito control aspects of the Arborvirus Response Plan discussion.
   7.9 Use of Permethrin for aerial application discussion.
   7.6 Use of Agnique to control pupae on environmentally sensitive lands discussion.

2. Please tell us how well the facilitator(s) helped the participants engage in the meeting.
   8.3 The participants followed the direction of the facilitator.
   9.0 The facilitator made sure the concerns of all participants were heard.
   9.3 The facilitator helped us arrange our time well.
   9.1 Participant input was documented accurately.

3. What is your level of satisfaction with the meeting?
   8.7 Overall, I am very satisfied with the meeting.
   9.0 I was very satisfied with the services provided by the facilitator.
   8.6 I am satisfied with the outcome of the meeting.

4. What progress did you make?
   9.2 I know what the next steps following this meeting will be.
   9.0 I know who is responsible for the next steps.

5. Do you have any other comments that you would like to add?
   ▪ Start meeting earlier at 8:00 AM.
   ▪ None – good job.
   ▪ A few delays “on issues” we should have voted up or down:
     1. Permethrin
     2. Arbovisus Response Plan- should have a FCCMC recommendation.
## ATTACHMENT 2

### MEETING ATTENDANCE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NAME</th>
<th>AFFILIATION</th>
<th>PHONE/FAX</th>
<th>EMAIL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lenore McCullagh</td>
<td>Audubon of FL</td>
<td>904-264-8384</td>
<td><a href="mailto:lmcstjohns@aol.com">lmcstjohns@aol.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mark Latham</td>
<td>Manatee Co. Mosquito CD</td>
<td>941-722-3720/941-721-0452</td>
<td><a href="mailto:manateemcd@aol.com">manateemcd@aol.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patricia Harden</td>
<td>F.D.E.</td>
<td>407-323-5678/407-323-5678 *51</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Pat4fla@aol.com">Pat4fla@aol.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alex Cordero</td>
<td>DEP</td>
<td>850-245-2094/850-245-2110</td>
<td><a href="mailto:alex.cordero@dep.state.fl.us">alex.cordero@dep.state.fl.us</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carina Blackmore</td>
<td>DEP</td>
<td>850-245-4732/850-922-8473</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Carina_Blackmore@dot.state.fl.us">Carina_Blackmore@dot.state.fl.us</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>John Smith</td>
<td>FAMU</td>
<td>850-872-4184 x 23/850-872-4733</td>
<td><a href="mailto:smith_j@popmail.firn.edu">smith_j@popmail.firn.edu</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>John Milio</td>
<td>USFWS</td>
<td>904-232-2580 8112/904-232-2404</td>
<td><a href="mailto:john_milio@fms.gov">john_milio@fms.gov</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Watson Tabachnick</td>
<td>UF-FMEL</td>
<td>772-778-7200/772-778-7205</td>
<td><a href="mailto:wjt@mail.ifas.ufl.edu">wjt@mail.ifas.ufl.edu</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eosel Fussell</td>
<td></td>
<td>305-292-7198/305-292-7199</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Edfussell@aol.com">Edfussell@aol.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mark Glisson</td>
<td>DEP</td>
<td>850-245-2773/850-245-2785</td>
<td><a href="mailto:mar.glisson@dep.state.fl.us">mar.glisson@dep.state.fl.us</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tom Loyless</td>
<td>DACS</td>
<td>850-922-7011/850-413-4177</td>
<td><a href="mailto:loylest@doacs.state.fl.us">loylest@doacs.state.fl.us</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Public

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Representation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>John Beidler</td>
<td>Private Citizen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Larry Hribar</td>
<td>Florida Keys MCD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>David Dane</td>
<td>DACS Entomological Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jennifer Simpson</td>
<td>DACS- Mosquito Control</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harry Zhong</td>
<td>Florida A &amp;M University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shea Tuberty</td>
<td>Appalachian St. University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nancy Page</td>
<td>Pinellas Co. MCD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jeff Ball</td>
<td>Pinellas Co. MCD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Karen Larson</td>
<td>Clarke Mosquito Control</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jim Stewart</td>
<td>Clarke Mosquito Control</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fraser Allen</td>
<td>ADAPCO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>David Malone</td>
<td>ADAPCO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bill Reynolds</td>
<td>ADAPCO. Inc</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne Gale</td>
<td>Lee Co. MCD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kellie Etherson</td>
<td>Gainesville MC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Katie Haggemeier</td>
<td>Lee County Mosquito Control</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amy Sargent</td>
<td>Florida Keys MCD</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>